



Seedco Industry Review Consultant Services

New York City Workforce Investment Board
and Department of Small Business Services

New York City Sectoral Research Project
Spring 2007



Table of Contents

Seedco Industry Review Consultant Services

New York City Workforce Investment Board
and Department of Small Business Services

New York City Sectoral Research Project
Spring 2007

- I. Executive Summary**
- II. Sectoral Quantitative Scan**
- III. Industry Snapshot Narratives:**
 - 1. Industrial Sector
 - 2. Healthcare Sector
 - 3. Retail and Hospitality/Tourism Sector
- IV. Sectoral-Based Career Center Decision-Making Matrix**

Executive Summary

Seedco was contracted by the New York City Workforce Investment Board and New York Department of Small Business Services to conduct an initial review of some of the fastest-growing sectors in New York City in order to identify appropriate sectors on which to base a sectorally-focused Workforce1 Career Center. Following our first review of fourteen different industries, we targeted three sectors, including two comprised of clusterings of similar industries, on which to perform an in-depth, research analysis. What follows are our findings, organized into Quantitative and Qualitative data, comprised of, 1) *sector statistical information* (including current number of jobs, projections of job growth, mean hourly wage), 2) *industry narratives* that detail the implications of these findings as complemented by over 35 qualitative interviews with industry leaders of the respective sectors, and 3) a final *qualitative “decision-making” data matrix*.

For the purpose of our work, “cluster” refers to a grouping of sectors. A “sector” is comprised of one or more industries, in which there are multiple, varied occupations. “Sector” and “industry” may be synonymous, as seen in the case of Healthcare, where we did not cluster Healthcare with any other industry. In the case of our two clusters, Industrial and Retail and Hospitality/Tourism, a “sector” of industries was created to represent unifying skills and characteristics among different jobs.

Sectoral Scan

Sector		Jobs							
Mid-level Positions Dispatchers, Except Police, Fire, and Ambulance Home Health Aides Nursing Aides, Orderlies, and Attendants Pharmacy Aides Licensed Practical and Licensed Vocational Nurses Cashiers Retail Salespersons Hazardous Materials Removal Workers Security Guards Protective Service Occupations Hotel/restaurant server Stock clerks and order fillers	6,750	1.7%	\$34,670	\$16.67	\$19,820	High School diploma	Some previous experience		
	80,280	26.8%	\$19,270	\$9.26	\$15,600	High School diploma	Some previous experience		
	58,130	16.5%	\$29,540	\$14.20	\$25,630	High School diploma	Some previous experience		
	2,130	8.3%	\$22,570	\$10.85	\$15,720	High School diploma	Some previous experience		
	22,860	8.9%	\$42,550	\$20.67	\$33,780	Post-secondary education	Significant experience		
	276,605	3.6%	\$16,730					36,540	6.31%
	103,380	1.8%	\$18,630	\$8.96	\$14,760	None	None		
	152,410	11.2%	\$24,470	\$11.77	\$15,710	High School diploma	Some previous experience		
	133,520	4.5%	\$19,330					n/a	n/a
	2,580	27.1%	\$50,620	\$24.34	\$33,770	High School diploma	Some previous experience		
77,610	5.3%	\$24,160	\$11.62	\$15,860	High School diploma	Some previous experience			
175,790	4.5%	\$40,390	\$18.78	\$19,330					
286,792	14.4%	\$39,193					n/a	n/a	
71,090	9.1%	\$24,170	\$11.62		None	None			
53,460	-15.7%	\$22,190	\$10.67	\$15,220	None	None			

Sectoral Scan

Sector	Jobs		Sources								
Tourism <i>Mid-level Positions</i> Reservation and Transportation Ticket Agents and Travel Clerks Transportation, Tourism, and Lodging Attendants <i>High-level Positions</i> Tour Guides and Escorts Recreation Workers	Hotel/Motel/Resort desk clerk	2,800	11.7%	\$29,190	\$14.03	\$19,700	High School diploma	Some previous experience	Hotel associate		
	Maids and Housekeeping cleaners	28,900	6.1%	\$29,320	\$14.10	\$22,960	High School diploma	Some previous experience	Housekeeper-- commercial, residential or industrial		
	Receptionists and information clerks	49,440	11.2%	\$27,180	\$13.07	\$20,830	High School diploma	Some previous experience			
	Hotel/restaurant-- bartender	13,640	7.1%	\$22,600	\$10.86	\$16,040	High School diploma	Some previous experience			
	Hotel/restaurant-- cook	20,960	9.0%	\$26,730	\$12.85	\$18,560	High School diploma	Some previous experience			
	Concierges	1,740	3.7%	\$33,250	\$15.99	\$28,990	High School diploma	Some previous experience			
	Reservation and Transportation Ticket Agents and Travel Clerks	5,940	-6.3%	\$33,230	\$15.98	\$23,480	High School diploma	Some previous experience			
	Transportation, Tourism, and Lodging Attendants	17,450	6.9%								
	Tour Guides and Escorts	1,520	14.3%	\$24,890	\$11.96	\$15,330	Post-secondary education	Significant experience			
	Recreation Workers	11,910	13.2%	\$24,320	\$11.69	\$17,340	Advanced degree	Significant experience			
Sources NYS DOL Occupational Projections BLS, May 2005 New York City Metropolitan Area Occupational Employment and Wage Estimates (New York, White Plains, Wayne, NJ) Entry Level Wage, NYS DOL OES** Average Annual Wage, BLS BLS, May 2005 New York City Metro Area Occupational Employment and Wage Estimates (New York, White Plains, Wayne, NJ) O*NET Online Occupational Information Network: http://online.onetcenter.org/ O*NET Online Occupational Information Network: http://online.onetcenter.org/ Censtats, NAICS Metro Business Patterns for NYC Censtats, NAICS Metro Business Patterns for NYC											

* **Bolded** wage is industry-wide average for entry-level positions. Not bolded wage is average wage for all levels of profession, *not* only for entry level.

Industrial Sector

Overview

The hundreds of thousands of jobs in the New York City's manual labor-based industries represent a strong base of jobs that are both accessible to working New Yorkers and situated within industries in acute need of workforce assistance. For the purposes of this review, we will refer to automotive repair, aviation, building services, commercial driving, construction and manufacturing as "industries," which, combined, represent the industrial "sector." Many of the jobs in these industries, like that of a commercial driver or building maintenance worker, are a good match for workers that have low to medium skill sets. The New York City Workforce system may provide value to these industries by providing central coordination to the hiring and training efforts taking place throughout the five boroughs. Finally, this sector has shown remarkable resilience and an ability to grow; a sector-focused Career Center could enable this sector to become more competitive, which would benefit the local economy as well as help the City meet its workforce development goals.

Sector Overview

The sectoral research revealed that automotive repair, aviation, building services, commercial driving, construction, and manufacturing industries offer significant opportunities for sector-based workforce activities. Marine shipping was not part of the final selection because there were too few jobs to justify an investment in targeted workforce services. Similarly, the Utilities and Telecommunications industry is not included in the sector because, although it represents a high volume of jobs, large companies have internal human resources departments that currently perform recruitment, screening and job-matching services to meet their needs. Furthermore, the Utilities and Telecommunications industry often requires a high level of math and reading aptitude for even the most basic jobs.

The industries that make up New York's Industrial Sector do not appear on the New York State Department of Labor's high growth lists because they are often considered cyclical, steady or declining. Nonetheless these industries represent a high volume of jobs, about 750,000 in total. Automotive repair, while not a growing industry is facing vast workforce shortages in the coming years, due to the aging out of its current workforce. The NYS DOL Employment Projections in 2002 estimated the need for close to 1,000 new auto mechanics in the next 10 years. Aviation, although stagnant in the recent past because of the industry's cyclical nature, is currently booming and there is strong demand for entry-level workers. Building services will continue to have significant and stable demand. NYS DOL statistics show that this industry currently employs close to 300,000 workers, the ranks of which will continue to grow with the high pace of construction around the City. The current high demand for commercial drivers, a demand that is expected to continue into the near future, is integrally linked to the strength of other sectors of the economy. For example, where there is an increase in tourism, retail, manufacturing, construction there is a need for drivers to transport people and goods. Construction is currently booming due to both a strong public, commercial and residential building employing approximately 250,000 workers. However the high

demand for labor in the commercial and residential construction markets will likely drop off during an economic downturn. Manufacturing, although on the whole rapidly shedding jobs, is predicted to grow and add jobs in niche and local production specialties such as food and apparel manufacturing. Sarah Garretson, President of the *Industrial and Technology Assistance Corporation*, explained,

“You will never again see the large-scale employers of the past in New York City. Companies who are trying to make the cheapest product are outsourcing. But what you have now is smaller firms, mostly under 100 employees. They are here because of they are highly customized, or because of access to markets. There has to be a reason they’re here.”

Jobs Overview

The City’s manual labor-based jobs are occupations that could provide the clientele of the Workforce1 system with wages ranging from \$10-\$20 an hour for entry-level positions. In the automotive repair and commercial driving industries, where the entry-level positions require skills and credentials, the entry-level wages range from \$15-\$20 an hour. Most of the jobs within the Industrial Sector are split between union and non-union positions. Union jobs generally offer better wages and benefits, and access to industry-paid training. Non-union entry-level occupations in aviation, building services, construction and manufacturing generally pay \$8-\$12 an hour. Due to competition and the large supply of unskilled labor, wages for non-union jobs are stagnant or dropping. One economic development policy analyst explained that the airlines are, “under such competitive pressures that most of the workforce is hired through contracting services companies, which pay low wages, from \$7 to \$10 an hour for most of the jobs.”

The potential for mobility within this sector is good, although not as strong as in sectors with more formal career ladders. For example, the commercial driving industry offers workers significant opportunity for experience-based wage growth and relatively accessible opportunities for entrepreneurship. Drivers that wish to can obtain their Class A license, for which there is high demand, but many of these opportunities require state-to-state trips and may not be ideal for the typical New Yorker. Aaron Shiffman of *Brooklyn Workforce Innovations* explained it plainly, “Long term career retention opportunities exist. It’s true that a store manager at Banana Republic will earn more than 15-year veteran driver, but how many retail jobs are really a gateway to anything else?” The automotive repair, aviation and manufacturing industries offer strong options for workers to access specialized skills training, especially as the industries suffer from attrition of older workers and advances to newer higher-tech practices. The building services and construction industries, both of which are minimally affected by changing technology, still offer traditional career pathways into higher-skilled trades, through apprenticeships and certifications.

Recruitment and Hiring

To a certain extent, although not across the board, there is a real need among the industries for assistance with their recruitment and hiring needs. Currently, the automotive, aviation and commercial driving industries have significant shortages of credentialed workers, and have each established partnerships with workforce training

intermediaries to help them fill those needs. In the building services, construction, and manufacturing industries non-union establishments do the vast majority of their recruitment and hiring through informal word-of-mouth networks. This presents an opportunity for an intermediary, like the New York City Workforce system, to provide these companies access to a pool of qualified labor more efficiently. David Sweeny, a private developer, explained that,

“A lot of times you’re dealing with immigrants without the familiarity and comfort of dealing with local government, and a lot of them hire by grabbing friends and family, and if they show up they get a job. In general, these companies would be tough to connect to, but there may in fact be a value-add for the city if they were able to break in, both in serving the workers who would need skills training to move up, and serving the companies who would benefit from more efficient and targeted hiring.”

The greatest challenge for a sector-focused Career Center may be connecting to the unionized segments of the building services and construction industries, which have traditionally recruited and hired exclusively through their existing networks. A union representative said,

“I’m not sure there is a there is a lack of workers applying for our jobs. We have a really large pool of people waiting, because they are union jobs, and I don’t think the need in our industry is being able to identify people who can step into slots.”

A representative of a contractors association expressed a similar sentiment, saying, “If there were to be a labor shortage, given the wage differential, we’ll attract people all the way from Buffalo, Boston, Philly.”

Job Requirements

The entry requirements for jobs in the Industrial Sector are generally low and emphasize technical skills and credentials over education. The entry-level jobs in the aviation, building services, construction and manufacturing industries require little more than motivation to work. However, aviation increasingly requires a GED for even its baggage handlers, likely a sign of just how many applicants there are for the available jobs. Entry-level positions in the automotive repair industry demand a higher aptitude because of the technical knowledge required, and companies often require a high school diploma and industry certification. The commercial driving industry does not require a high school diploma for its entry-level jobs, but workers do need a CDL license. Increasingly, mid-level positions in all of the industries require specialized certifications, which demand a higher aptitude for math and computers and, increasingly, communication skills.

Workers Characteristics

The jobs in the Industrial Sector often require physical labor, nonstandard workdays and overtime hours. The construction, manufacturing and automotive repair industries can operate around the clock, especially when time is a crucial factor in gaining advantage in competitive markets. Many of the positions in the aviation and commercial driving industries, like packing and delivering goods and products, take place during the night so the public has access to what they need when the day begins.

The Industrial Sector jobs represent, perhaps, the greatest opportunity for the City's Workforce system to reach out to traditionally underserved groups. Since a large number of jobs that do not require employees to interface with customers, companies are often open to hiring workers with limited English proficiency and, with the exception of the aviation industry, criminal backgrounds. Similarly, jobs in the automotive repair and construction industries are increasingly open to women and minorities.

Implementation

In order to be successful, a program focused on Industrial Sector would require connecting with tens of thousands of small and medium size companies.

Advantageously, the sector offers a number of strong intermediary organizations that offer both opportunities and challenges for partnership. The City has begun to exhibit leadership in pushing the sector forward, with the creation of the Mayor's Office for Industrial and Manufacturing Businesses, the Mayor's Commission for Construction Opportunity and Construction Skills 2000, an initiative training high school students in the building and construction trades, and now may be an ideal time to capitalize on this political will.

The New York Industrial Retention Network and the Industrial and Technology Assistance Corporation, both widely respected intermediaries, could be valuable partners in reaching out to and coordinating diverse and far-flung companies. The automotive repair and commercial driving industries have already built relationships with training intermediaries to help fill their hiring needs, for which the Consortium for Worker Education and Brooklyn Workforce Innovations have proven to be strong and energetic partners. The Council for Airport Opportunity, established to address the aviation industry's workforce needs, could play a stronger role as an intermediary. The building services and construction unions have shown their receptivity to collaboration on the City's workforce initiatives, signing on as partners in the Mayor's Commission for Construction Opportunity and Construction Skills 2000. The non-union portions of the building services, construction and manufacturing industries are scattered and unorganized, and could greatly benefit from an intermediary organization.

Conclusion

To effectively serve the Industrial Sector, a strong vendor that understands the diverse needs and challenges of this varied sector would be essential. Overall, the manual labor-based industries offer opportunities that are currently unavailable in other sectors of New York's economy. This sector offers an increasing number of easily-accessible jobs for workers with barriers to employment such as limited math and English proficiency, or criminal backgrounds. Similarly, the sector offers defined career ladders and wage mobility for those able to advance either through job experience or relatively short-term skills trainings.

Retail and Hospitality/Tourism Sector

Overview

The combined sector of Retail and Hospitality/Tourism represents a strong base of jobs that are accessible to working New Yorkers. Each of these high-growth industries are united by a core set of transferable ‘customer service’ skills. They also provide fairly plentiful entry-level jobs for low-skilled New Yorkers. Moreover, employers in the retail industry, and many within tourism and hospitality industries, are eager to partner with the City to better standardize the skill sets and training of incoming workers.

Sector Overview

The Retail, Hospitality, and Tourism sector currently maintains a large number of available jobs, and projects growth in number of employers in the future. There were 36,540 retail businesses reported in New York City in 2002 alone. Overall, positions in this customer service-based sector are a reliable area of employment in the City, and industry demand dictates an influx of new jobs over the next five years (for example, the number of jobs in the Hospitality industry is projected to increase by 14.4% by 2014). Beyond the numbers, it is clear from the qualitative industry scan that the sector is continuing to expand in the City. There are currently 276,605 retail positions being filled in the New York City area, and new City retail markets are developing throughout the five boroughs, most notably in Harlem and along Atlantic Avenue in Brooklyn.

The projected long-term need for entry-level employees with strong customer service skills in New York City is reinforced by leading members of the sector interviewed for this project. In addition to filling entry-level vacancies, there will be demand to retrain the current population of entry-level workers to meet the need in mid-level and supervisory positions. The need for mid-level retail associates, for example, is projected to increase 11.2% by 2014. Retail, notorious for job turnover, stands to benefit the most from a sector-focused Career Center that emphasizes career pathways within the industry as a strategy to retain entry-level workers. Complementary to the rise in retail growth, the Hospitality/Tourism industry is projected to continue to expand due to the prolific rate of new and returning visitors to the greater New York metropolitan area. It is expected that New York City tourism will surpass 67 million visitors a year by 2010.

Although the overall picture of this sector is positive, there are a few industries that were not included in this scan because of thin levels of employment. For example, cruise lines are not a viable choice for target by a sector-focused Career Center because the industry offers seasonal jobs, and the majority of the jobs are not based in New York. Similarly, call centers, a perfect venue for individuals with strong customer service backgrounds, are generally not based in New York because of the high cost of real estate.

Jobs Overview

There are a number of points of access for an entry-level worker looking to begin a career in the Hospitality and Tourism industries, including basic entry-level jobs like concierge/reception, hotel attendants, maintenance/housekeeping, food service and

security. The Retail sector is more limited in scope, highlighting Sales Associates as one of the primary positions. Although these entry-level positions are easy to come by, low wages, an average starting salary of \$8.96 an hour, and lack of benefits like health insurance, do not prompt entry-level Retail associates to stay long enough in a position to gain access to the next step on the career ladder. The Tourism industry often offers higher wages and benefits, but does not have defined career pathways. Because of this, and because the most stable employers in the industry are the Hospitality employers, including hotel chain operations, maintenance, and food concessions, we have approached Tourism through the lens of Hospitality, focusing on the more well-defined career pathways in hotels.

Hotels large and small are 85% unionized in New York, which is the primary source of employees for this industry. Some hotels are receptive to non-union employees that come in with a certain level of customer service expertise. Due to higher wages and better benefits in entry-level Hospitality jobs, both union and non-union, entrance into the industry is competitive. The largest non-union hotel is the Marriott Marquis, but opportunities also exist with smaller non-union hotels in the City.

Recruitment and Training

One of the greatest advantages to working with the Retail and Hospitality/Tourism sector is the clarity around training and needed skills within the field. This essentially consists of strong customer relations skills and an industry-based understanding of the English language. Definitions of exactly what these skills are and how to acquire them is becoming more and more concrete in the field. There are established assessment tests, training curriculum and a defined career pathway developed by the National Retail Federation Foundation that could be utilized by a City-operated Career Center. Unlike other sectors with equally promising numbers of jobs, the customer service sector offers ready-made plans, training, and the experience of other national retail One Stop Career Centers.

This sector is also moving toward industry standards around recruitment and training. Working with these industries offers an opportunity to use existing national standards with customization for the specific needs of New York City employers. One industry representative noted that, "Large employers like Home Depot are increasingly interested in certifications." In general, the industry has expressed need for a uniform system of training and recruitment, which a sector-focused Career Center could satisfy by filling the role of liaison between marketable employees and employers. Large employers, including retail and hotel chains, may be enthusiastic about hiring significant numbers of employee candidates en masse who have gone through strong, standardized customer service training.

Another advantage is the low cost of training within the sector. Curricula have been developed for customer service skills, and requirements for English skills are relatively low, with employers demanding only a working knowledge of the industry-specific vocabulary.

Worker Characteristics

The Retail, Hospitality, and Tourism sector has many openings for the target population identified by the City for a sector-focused Career Center. Many positions do not require technical skill sets or high levels of education; in fact, many do not require a GED for entry-level positions. English proficiency is also not a requirement; Suma Kurien of *LaGuardia Community College* noted that 50% of current New York hotel workers are non-native English speakers. This is also a field that hires a large number of women, background checks are often a requirement, especially in the case of Hospitality, and the physical labor required in most positions precludes certain populations from applying for many positions. Although jobs are available in this sector, many positions are now being filled with workers from outside of the City. Mary Moorhouse of the *National Retail Federation* confirms that many of the most eligible people for entry-level retail positions in New York are being found outside of the city, including New Jersey.

Implementation

There are many high-profile partners in the Retail industry willing to work with the City workforce system to establish an effective sector-focused Career Center. The National Retail Federation Foundation, which has already provided support for the development of the Queens Center Mall Retail Training Center through curriculum and training assistance, is enthusiastic about the development of a sector-focused Career Center in New York.

The Hospitality/Tourism industry is comprised of many large employers receptive to a customer service skills-focused Career Center, but many industry leaders were hesitant due to the number of relationships that would need to be managed by the City in order for a Career Center to be successful. However, major hotels may be more enthusiastic if they have a better understanding of the City's successful past relationships working with large employers, as evidenced by the City's experience with the Mandarin Oriental Hotel.

Based on the qualitative interviews with Retail and Hospitality leaders, a City-run and operated Career Center focused on the Retail and Hospitality/Tourism sector would be a positive addition to the City's job environment. Retail is considered easier to direct initial efforts into, based on the enthusiasm of larger employers around a potential training center to recruit employees with strong customer service skills. The Queens Center Mall Retail Training Center, now in the first stages of development with LaGuardia Community College, is a partner willing to collaborate and frame the dialogue on real potential for careers in the Retail sector. The Marriott Marquis and other non-union hotels may be the easiest point of entry into the Hospitality field. After proven success increasing and maintaining relationships with industry employers and providing quality workforce by the sector-focused Career Center large union hotels may be more interested in partnering with the City to meet their hiring needs.

Conclusion

There are aspects of the Retail and Hospitality/Tourism sector that may require more in-depth consideration prior to engaging the sector in a Career Center relationship, for example low wages in the Retail industry, undefined career ladders in Tourism, and difficulty gaining entry to positions in union facilities in the Hospitality industry. The current state of the sector provides a great opportunity for the City to coordinate the existing training programs available and where possible to tailor programs to meet the needs of New York City businesses and workforce.

This sector affords the opportunity to provide basic training in customer service, which is a transferable skill set across a number of industries, thereby empowering the current workforce to qualify for a larger number of jobs in growing industries. A City intermediary like a Career Center could act as a link between employers and employees, as well as between complementary industries. This relationship would allow the Career Center to better meet the needs of the industries, and effectively work with employers to develop ways to improve the quality of jobs across the sector. Due to the number of available jobs, large employers eager to establish relationships, and a low-skill population in need of reliable access into a growing industry, the Retail and Hospitality/Tourism sector is a viable option for a sector-focused Career Center.

Health Care Sector

Overview

The health care sector continues to enjoy impressive growth nationwide, resulting in high demand for positions at all levels of experience. The sector articulates clear career ladders, and places an emphasis on soft skills, rather than technical experience in entry-level positions like Direct Care Attendants. However, this sector faces a number of challenges, including a large gap between low-quality, entry-level positions and higher-level positions which require at least a year of advanced education or additional training, and managing relationships with unionized facilities.

Sector Overview

Health care is a large sector in New York City, representing 182,220 jobs in the region in 2005. The sector continues to grow and is projected to grow further with the aging of the baby boomer population. The New York State Department of Labor projects that the broader health care support field in New York City will grow by 22.3% between 2004 and 2014; entry-level home health aide (HHA) positions, which constitute 48% of the field of healthcare support occupations, will grow by 34.2% for the same period. Although hospital closings proposed by the Berger Commission cast some questions over the field as a whole, the future looks bright for the sector in New York City and nationwide. Such growth trends make experienced employees in this sector valuable, and qualified entry-level employees are in high demand.

Traditionally, health care is a popular career choice among jobseekers, therefore employers usually have little trouble recruiting and hiring applicants, especially for entry-level non-clinical jobs and jobs for which extensive training is not required. Demand continues to be high for mid-level health care positions that require some training, such as nursing and nursing assistant occupations. Employees in the field that succeed in entry-level positions, and have both access to resources and the ambition necessary to complete additional training, can move easily into mid-level positions. Such dramatic growth has made the health care sector a popular subject for job placement programs across the country, and workforce programs have had success in several locations, including Philadelphia, Pennsylvania and Hollywood, California.

Jobs Overview

Although jobs in this sector are plentiful, jobseekers with low skills and education levels often only have access to low level positions as direct care attendants and HHAs. Entry-level HHA positions are the most commonly available jobs, and are notoriously difficult, requiring long hours, prolonged one-on-one contact with patients in their homes, physical strength, and irregular schedules. A college administrator with experience in the field commented that,

“The HHA field represents the largest portion of entry-level jobs in health care, and is also the fastest growing entry-level occupation, but that occupation continues to be plagued by a high turnover rate, which is due in part to the difficult working conditions.”

Direct care positions, including nursing aides, orderlies, and attendants, are typically more attractive to workers because the pay is higher, schedules are more likely to be set from week to week, and positions may be unionized. For example, the average hourly rate for HHAs in the New York City region is \$9.26 (\$19,370 annually). The average hourly rate for direct care workers is \$14.20 (\$31,330 annually). According to the United States Bureau of Labor Statistics, the higher rate of unionization in direct care is most responsible for the higher wage in those positions.

Turnover is a major problem in entry-level positions in this sector. Some industry experts believe that there are ways to mitigate this problem, while providing new opportunities for employees and employers alike. For example, employers could invest in the professional development of HHA employees by providing minimal training and support within their first year or two on the job, thereby decreasing turnover and increasing job satisfaction. An administrator at a HHA workforce development program interviewed for this project said that capable, experienced HHAs could take some of the burden away from nurses and nursing assistants if their skills are further developed. Without advanced training and certification, movement up the career ladder from entry to mid-level jobs in health care is nearly impossible. Training is lengthy and expensive, and also requires strong math and science aptitude. Workers can become dissatisfied quickly by the difficult and inaccessible career ladder unless they are linked to affordable training options that are accessible to non-traditional working students.

Recruitment and Hiring

The lengthy employee recruitment and hiring process for hospital positions is done primarily through the union. Hiring generally happens on an ongoing, rolling basis, and unions provide opportunities for incumbent advancement to their members. Non-union agencies tend to have their own human resources procedures, generally involving a regimented screening process for all applicants.

Job Requirements

Requirements for most entry-level positions in this sector typically include a high school diploma or equivalent, and a clean criminal record; employers rarely make exceptions on these two requirements. A valid driver's license may sometimes be required of new hires, due to the common requirement for emergency readiness plans, but this is more often a preference than a requirement. Limited English proficiency is not necessarily a barrier to employment, depending on the employer and position, as long as the worker can follow directions and complete tasks efficiently and effectively. Soft skills, such as having a caring, respectful personal manner and experience caring for family members can be useful in the application process, which often helps low skilled applicants who may lack educational experience or specific occupational training gain access to the sector. Most entry-level positions require some very basic training and credentials, such as first aid and CPR, which are customarily provided by the employer.

For entry-level health care workers to advance up the career ladder, a serious commitment to substantial training will be required. Training programs are the only way that HHAs and entry-level direct care workers can advance to positions that require a

specific credential or license such as Certified Nursing Assistant, Licensed Practical Nurse, or other nursing positions. The barriers to this training should not be underestimated. For example the Los Angeles One Stop, which has a health sector initiative, spends an average of \$400 on training per client. A City University of New York official with experience in the field noted,

“The training required to move up in the health care field can range from \$250 for a pharmacy technician to \$1,200 for LPN training, and when you add in a year’s commitment and the scarcity of training vouchers in New York City, it can make it nearly impossible for a low-income workers to make that leap.”

Worker Characteristics

Positions in the health care sector are often attractive to low-skill and first-time jobseekers, due to the emphasis on soft skills and the rewarding nature of one-on-one care. Workers with criminal backgrounds are excluded from most opportunities in health care. Workers with limited English skills are welcome, and workers with dual language skills are highly valued for their ability to serve with diverse populations.

The scheduling requirements of the industry often pose a problem for workers, especially those with children. Shifts run around the clock for all positions, although workers with more experience tend to have greater preference in their work schedules, and some even choose night and weekend hours in order to earn overtime. Schedules for home health aides tend to be the most unpredictable, varying from week to week, which is a factor that is considered to play a large role in the industry’s high turnover.

Implementation

The 1199 National Health Care Workers’ Union is especially strong in New York City; unionized employers are required by contract to refer all jobs to the union and to give the union seven days of preferred hiring status before opening up the position to the public. There are, nonetheless, opportunities to partner with the unions in this sector, with the City helping to fill gaps where the union is unable to provide services. One union representative said,

“A One Stop program in the health care sector could partner with the union and help their clients apply for jobs after the seven day preference period. In addition, the union might be able to refer jobs to the One Stop that it typically has trouble filling, such as part-time positions.”

Differences are sharp between union and non-union jobs in this sector, in both compensation and quality of work, and most experts who work with the industry recommended partnering with the union to coordinate resources, troubleshoot potential pitfalls, build off existing collaborations, and fill vacancies efficiently.

In order for a Career Center to be successful in the health care sector the first step must include reaching out to the local unions to develop a partnership and identify overlap in the recruiting and placing mechanisms. The next step would be to work with the unions to identify available entry-level jobs and employers in New York City, and to form ancillary partnerships with these employers. It will be important to determine what

training is necessary to meet the needs of employers, while keeping in mind the career opportunities that will be available to jobseekers. Additionally, the Career Center should heed lessons from similar efforts in Philadelphia, Los Angeles, and elsewhere in the country to determine the best ways to confront this multi-faceted industry in a way that provides the best long-term outcomes for its customers.

Conclusion

The health care sector presents many attractive opportunities for employment and growth; however, it may prove to be a difficult sector for low-income, low-skilled entry-level job seekers to achieve long-term success. Entry-level employment opportunities are limited to only a handful of occupations, and while available positions are plentiful in these occupations, they are often low-paying and low-quality, mandating long and irregular hours. Perhaps the most discouraging characteristic of this sector is the difficulties workers face advancing up the career ladder. Experts agree that while employees qualified to perform mid- and high-level health care jobs are in high demand, but that entry-level employees rarely have access to the substantial time and resources that are required to move up within the sector. Any program focusing on job placement in this sector should start by reaching out to local union chapters, which currently work to mitigate the problems inherent to the sector. Creative work with unions and large employers might uncover ways to confront problems like high turnover and inaccessible training, while taking advantage of the industry's strong points, such as sustained growth and plentiful entry-level jobs. A Career Center focused on supporting the advancement of entry-level workers to address mid-level job shortages could help stem turnover and encourage upward mobility in the field through training and support.

Sectoral Decision-Making Matrix

Industrial Sectors		
Industry Characteristics	Pros	Cons
<p>Growth/Demand</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High demand for workers in automotive, construction and commercial driving, steady demand in aviation and building services. • Booms in individual sectors fuel growth in other sectors. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All industries either stagnant, declining or cyclical. • Economic downturns may adversely affect entire cluster of industries.
<p>Compensation/Benefits</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Entry-level automotive, commercial driving, union construction, union building services, and mid-level maintenance jobs start at \$15-\$20. • Benefits available for union positions. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Entry-level non-union jobs in aviation, building services, construction and manufacturing pay \$8-\$12 an hour.
<p>Turnover</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strong retention in automotive, unionized construction and commercial driving. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High turnover in aviation, non-union construction and manufacturing.
<p>Recruitment/Hiring</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strong need for recruitment and hiring in automotive and commercial driving. • Although hiring currently done through informal networks, potential for in labor matching for aviation and non-union construction and manufacturing. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Building services and construction unions have little interest in partnership.
<p>Intermediaries/Trainers</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Employers scattered, but a number of effective intermediaries that would be good government partners. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Employers are often family-run and scattered throughout the city; clear implementation plan will be necessary.
<p>Job Characteristics--Entry Level</p>		
<p>Basic Requirements</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Low education, no experience needed for construction, driving, aviation and manufacturing. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High school diploma required for automotive. • Standard driver's license required for commercial driving.
<p>Opportunity for Growth</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Movement into skilled positions very achievable in automotive, building services and construction with additional skills training. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mobility in aviation, commercial driving and manufacturing mostly limited to wage growth and entrepreneurialism. • Increasingly, need basic math/communication/computers for all skilled positions.
<p>Job Characteristics--Mid Level</p>		
<p>Basic Requirements</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Some possibility for promotion to supervisory positions without additional training in manufacturing and driving. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All mid-level positions require training/apprenticeship and certification.
<p>Worker Characteristics</p>		
<p>Special Populations</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All industries except aviation open to ex-offenders. • All industries open to limited english proficient. • Women increasingly present in automotive and construction. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited access for disabled populations.
<p>Scheduling</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High potential for overtime in commercial driving and construction. • All positions full-time. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All industries require irregular hours, and are likely difficult for single parents.

Sectoral Decision-Making Matrix

Health Care Sector	
Pros	Cons
Industry Characteristics	
Growth/Demand	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Growing industry, especially in entry level positions. • High demand for qualified clinical workers.
Compensation/Benefits	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Some unionized hospital positions offer better pay for entry-level positions.
Turnover	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Less turnover for unionized jobs. • Support and training may help reduce turnover.
Recruitment/Hiring	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Recruiting is ongoing, high demand. • Potential role to be played in helping backfill for entry level as workers move up.
Intermediaries/Trainers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Unions provide training for members moving into higher-skill positions. • Field offers a number of strong training providers, especially community colleges.
Job Characteristics--Entry Level	
Basic Requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Soft skills/people skills and prior care experience valued over hard skills.
Opportunity for Growth	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Clear career ladders for movement into clinical positions.
Job Characteristics--Mid Level	
Basic Requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Entry-level experience can help with training for and excelling in advanced positions.
Opportunity for Growth	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Clear career ladders to advance to RN positions.
Worker Characteristics	
Special Populations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited english applicants welcome. • Soft skills can give applicant significant boost. • Many new employees find jobs rewarding.
Scheduling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Many part-time positions open. • Jobs available throughout New York City.

Sectoral Decision-Making Matrix

Retail/Hospitality Sector

Retail/Hospitality Sector		Pros	Cons
Industry Characteristics			
Growth/Demand	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New retail developments throughout the city, and dramatic, increase in need for entry level employees. • High growth in hospitality for maintenance operations and hotel services, steady growth for all others. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No increased demand for advanced positions in retail. 	
Compensation/Benefits	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Benefits available in retail with advancement. • High wages and benefits for union hospitality jobs, good pay for non-union. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Wages less than \$10 an hour and no benefits in entry level retail. • No benefits for non-union jobs in hospitality. 	
Turnover	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Very little turnover in hotel service positions. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extremely high turnover in retail. 	
Recruitment/Hiring	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Large employers in retail and hospitality recruit large numbers of employees at once. • Many employers already comfortable with One Stops for recruitment and hiring. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Small retail and non-union hotels hire by word of mouth. • Union hotels limit recruitment to members. • Online application process for large Hospitality employers. • Advanced positions in large hotels filled internally. 	
Intermediaries/Trainers	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strong industry associations in retail and hospitality, willingness to work with government on improved employment services. • Existing training curricula in both retail and hospitality. 		
Job Characteristics--Entry Level			
Basic Requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • English proficiency not required, good customer service skills. • Limited education required. • No credentials required (certifications being developed). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increasing industry demand for higher education in entry level in retail and hospitality. 	
Opportunity for Growth	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Implicit and pre-designed career pathways in retail and hospitality. • Hospitality advancement is more broad, can include becoming part of the union to raise wages and gain benefits. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Retail advancement is possible, but there are fewer positions as one moves up the career ladder. • Supervisory positions in hotels are non-union, people often choose to stay in basic positions to keep benefits and job security. 	
Job Characteristics--Mid Level			
Basic Requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • English fluency, advanced customer service skills. • Advancement primarily linked to experience, good track record of customer service. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Higher wages and better job opportunities linked to education. 	
Worker Characteristics			
Special Populations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited English-friendly. • Jobs open to those with limited education 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No ex-offenders in hospitality. • Increasing need for English with advancement. 	
Scheduling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Full-time hospitality job hours are more consistent, especially for union positions. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hospitality jobs can require longer and later hours, especially for part-time concession employees. • Retail does not offer reliable hours, most positions start out as part time. 	